Board of Judicial Policy and Administration

TEAMS Meeting December 14, 2020 9:00 A.M. – NOON

MINUTES

BJPA Members: Chief Justice Michael Davis (Chair), Justice Kate Fox, Justice Lynne Boomgaarden, Judge Catherine Wilking, Judge Catherine Rogers, Judge Thomas Rumpke, Judge Wes Roberts, Judge Curt Haws, Judge Wendy Bartlett

Agenda Items		
Roll Call	All members were present.	
Welcome	Chief Justice Davis welcomed members and other attendees.	
New Judicial	1. Sixth Judicial District: Stuart Healy	
Appointments	A. Judge Deegan Retiring December 25, 2020	
	Governor Gordon appointed Stuart Healy to be a District Court Judge for the Sixth Judicial District serving Campbell, Weston, and Crook Counties.	
	2. Eighth Judicial District: Clark Allan	
	A. Judge Case Retiring January 3, 2021	
	Governor Gordon appointed Clark Allan to be a Circuit Court Judge for the Eighth Judicial District serving Converse, Niobrara, and Platte Counties.	
	Chief Justice Davis noted Lily Sharpe's upcoming retirement. Her leadership during notably difficult times helped shape and revolutionize Court Administration. She worked tirelessly for the Judicial Branch and will be deeply missed.	
Children's Justice Project	1. Update – Lisa Finkey	
	Through work being done at the federal level and with other states, it is clear Wyoming is a leader in terms of virtual hearings.	
	The new Federal Fiscal year recently began. The 2019 budget allowed for the purchase of printers for the district courts, aided in the purchased of two Microsoft Surface Hubs for Natrona Count, and allowed a contribution of approximately thirty thousand dollars (\$30,000) towards the juvenile	

customizations for the district court case management system, FullCourt Enterprise. Allocations for the 2020 budget include paying for any district judge who wishes to attend the Joint Symposium on Children and Youth or the National Association for Counsel for Children (NACC) Conference in Denver. The Symposium has gone virtual and its anticipated the NACC Conference will be as well.

A series of webinars have been created. Topics such as parental substance abuse have been well received and distributed throughout the State for training. Those trainings may be accessed through the CJP website.

Equal Justice Wyoming

1. Update – Angie Dorsch

Normal in-person events have been canceled during the pandemic. Online resources and the Wyoming Free Legal Answers platform have been heavily promoted to fill the void. Staff continues to provide appointments for self-help services via the phone. There has been a strong focus on recruiting more attorneys to help aid in providing services virtually. This has proved to be difficult as attorneys have been very busy during the pandemic.

Equal Justice Wyoming provides grants to various legal aid providers throughout the State. Grants were being made in the middle of the pandemic, and there were concerns about revenue. There was a notable decrease in revenue in the Spring. The decision was made to not decrease any of the funding to grantees. Over one million one hundred fourteen thousand dollars (\$1.14M) in grants were given to legal aid providers for fiscal year 2021.

The Victims of Crime Act Funding was reduced by fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000). That loss and others have been absorbed by other funds. Additionally, the Staff Attorney/Pro Bono Coordinator position will remain vacant for the time being.

The Equal Justice Wyoming Foundation is a separate 501(c)(3) organization and administers the IOLTA funds to support legal services. A funding projection indicated there will likely be a decrease in these funds by about fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000). There is a push to replace these funds through private fundraising. The Wyoming State Bar has pledged to match up to twenty-five thousand dollars (\$25,000). The Foundation made grant awards for the 2021 calendar year and increased the amount granted due to the increased need for additional funding.

There is a concern about the increase in legal service needs as the pandemic continues. If there are trends you are seeing or any way to help the low-income population, please relay that information to Equal Justice Wyoming.

COVID-19

1. Funding – Claire Smith

The process has been started to revert any unused funds. Those reversions include:

• Two million four hundred thousand dollars (\$2.4M) from Court

Technology;

- Approximately half of the two hundred thousand dollars (\$200,000) received for PPE;
- Three hundred thousand dollars (\$300,000) from the Jury Adaptation fund; and
- Substantial amount from the County Infrastructure pot (Reimbursement requests have been in the five thousand to ten thousand dollar (\$5,000 \$10,000) range). Will begin contact with counties that have not submitted requests this week.

Smaller pots of funds have mostly been spent. The Governor's Office will likely place all our unspent funds in the Unemployment Compensation Fund.

2. Procedures - Brenda Reedy

Please contact Brenda Reedy, the Human Resources Manager should an employee test positive or be presumptive positive for COVID-19. If exposure happened in the workplace, she will additionally report and track that information for the OSHA log and Workers' Compensation.

3. Update on Employee Cases – Brenda Reedy

In November the Judicial Branch saw thirteen (13) positive cases, four (4) with close contact, and one (1) with secondary contact. So far in December there have been four (4) positive cases, four (4) with close contact, and one (1) with secondary contact.

The first round of COVID-19 vaccinations has been shipped out to the states. The courts are not in the first phase to receive those, as the focus is on health care workers, first responders, and those in law enforcement. An item to consider as an employer is if there should be a priority for court personnel for courts to operate in a safe and effective manner. There is no specific guidance regarding courts yet. It is anticipated more information will be released as the vaccination phases continue.

Legislative Interim Meetings

1. Joint Judiciary Committee, October 26 and 27 - Lily Sharpe

The Committee heard testimony on several items relating to the Judicial Branch. One bill of interest is the Ethics and Disclosure Act Amendments:

• Ethics and Disclosure Act Amendments, 21LSO60 v.4 (Appendix 1)

The bill draft expands the scope of the Act to include the Judicial Branch. Wendy Soto, the Executive Director of the Commission on Judicial Conduct and Ethics, explained the authority of the Commission and emphasized that the bill draft violates Separation of Powers. Judge Wilking expressed the importance of citizen members of the Commission. Joe Baron, Crook County Prosecuting Attorney, spoke in favor of the bill's criminal penalty applying to the Judicial Branch. The Committee removed the "judiciary" from p. 12, line 21.

The Committee also heard from the Chief Justice, Judge Wilking, Judge Christensen, and Tina Wood, the Crook County Clerk of District Court regarding CARES Act funding, court operations during the pandemic, Chancery Court, email filing, and concerns regarding the proposed Title 25 bill.

Joint Appropriations Committee, October 26 and 27 – Claire Smith

The Joint Appropriations Committee recently held budget hearings. During the hearings, Senator Perkins expressed his opinion that chancery court functions should shift to the district court judges. There was not much discussion on moving forward any other way. It was offered to delay the eFiling contract and upgrade to the Appellate Case Management System. There was no interest in doing so. A recurring theme emerged about how much of our employee salaries could be cut. Responses to questions will be sent to the Legislative Service Office, and budget markup will begin on December 15, 2020.

Chancery Court Committee

Judicial Members: Justice Fox (Chair), Chief Justice Davis, Judge Fenn, Judge Waldrip, Ret., Judge Sullins, Ret.

1. Update – Justice Fox

The existing legislation provides for district court judges to act as chancery court judges for an interim period before the full-time chancery court judge is to be appointed in March of 2022. Through discussions with the Joint Judiciary Committee and Joint Appropriations Committee, it was learned that date could be pushed out to 2026. We have requested to keep the dedicated law clerk position.

Configurations are being made to the chancery court case management system. Staff will then begin work on the eFiling system.

Judicial Conference Reports

<u>Circuit Conference President:</u> Judge Christensen

<u>District Conference President:</u> Judge Wilking

1. Circuit Court Conference – Judge Christensen

The courts are open; however, jury trials ceased at the beginning of November. All other hearings are held based on the protocol of individual courts. Additionally, the Circuit Court Conference Winter Meeting was held remotely via Microsoft TEAMS.

A. Judicial Poll Concerns

Every two years the Judicial Poll is conducted. This is an advisory poll that is organized by the Wyoming State Bar. There are reoccurring concerns with the poll. Results are released shortly before judges sit for retention, and less than half of the Bar participates. The issue stems from the poll only being a snapshot in time and many times individual attorneys tend to voice displeasure in recent decisions. This year the poll received media coverage regarding opposition to retain a judge. There would be benefit for an internal committee to review the process.

Judge Roberts moved to form a subcommittee composed of justices, district court and circuit court judges to start discussions and provide direction on how to handle the issue. Justice Fox seconded the motion. There was no further discussion by the Board. Judge Roberts called for the question. The motion passed unanimously on voice vote.

Chief Justice Davis asked the Conferences to find volunteers for the

subcommittee. An order appointing will be signed once the names are received. (Appendix 2)

2. District Court Conference – Judge Wilking

The District Court Conference Winter Meeting was held virtually last week via Microsoft TEAMS.

A. Park Security Concerns

Security at the Park County Courthouse is a concern. Movement at the local level to resolve the issue has not been successful. Judge Roberts noted this topic should be addressed during the next Court Security Commission. Ronda Munger relayed she will meet with Justice Kautz and Judge Roberts to move this forward. If necessary, there is benefit to having the Chief Justice participate in these issues as they arise as well.

Judicial Branch Technology

Courtroom Automation Committee

Members: Chief Justice Davis (Chair), Judge Fenn, Judge Edelman, Judge Campbell, Judge Christensen, Judge Castano, Judge Haws

Courtroom Technology

<u>Committee</u> Members: Chief Justice Davis (Chair), Justice Fox, Judge Lavery, Judge Johnson, Judge Christensen, and Judge Prokos

Court Automation – Elisa Butler and Heather Kenworthy

1. DCAC/CCAC - Heather Kenworthy

A. FCE Circuit

The rollout of FullCourt Enterprise in the circuit courts was completed in November. Migration and data fixes are expected to be complete by the end of December.

B. FCE District

Staff plans to send the migration data to the vendor, Justice Systems Inc, by the end of the month to begin working on the next phase in preparation for rolling out the pilot courts. Work is ongoing to train the district courts in preparation for migration.

The rollout schedule has not yet been set. There are factors that need to be considered for the individual courts. One example is the need to provide some district court clerk's offices the new case management system to replace end-of-life software. Those courts must be rolled out at the beginning. Training for the pilot courts will begin in May/June, and the first pilot will go-live in the Summer of 2021.

EFiling information is now available on the Judicial Branch website. There you can find information regarding the project, timeline, and various reports.

2. Jury Management – Heather Kenworthy

A. Commencement of Activities for Group 5

Training for Group 5 has commenced and will be completed by the end of the week. These clerks will pull the first jury list in December/January. The training for the final rollout Group 6 will happen in the Summer of 2021.

EFiling – Elisa Butler

1. Update

Staff has dedicated much time to work through the contract with the vendor. The plan is to have the contract completed by the end of the month.

Courtroom Technology - Nate Goddard

1. COVID-19 Funded Technology

A. Courtroom Technology

The request for a second round of COVID-19 funding was approved. Most of the courtrooms will be upgraded to the Courtroom Technology Standard by the end of the year. Fifty-six (56) courtrooms have been upgraded, and it is anticipated six (6) more will be completed by the end of December. An additional sixty-five (65) Surface Hubs were purchased for use in jury rooms.

B. COVID-19 Equipment/Software

The ability to teleconference and work remotely has been an integral part in completing work of the Judicial Branch during the pandemic. Two hundred (200) additional laptops were purchased and were provided to all employees that did not currently have one. Two hundred (200) headsets and seventy (70) web cameras were also acquired. One hundred and fifty (150) iPads were purchased to ship out to the courts for use by pro se litigants who may not have the ability to otherwise appear remotely.

Additional software was deemed necessary to operate efficiently during the pandemic. These items include:

- VPN High Availability;
- Liberty Recording in district court courtrooms;
- Cisco Umbrella; and
- Barracuda.

Permanent Rules Advisory Committee (PRAC)

<u>Court Records Division</u> Judicial Members: Justice Gray, Judge Overfield, Judge Castano

Appellate Division

Judicial Members: Justice Boomgaarden, Judge Fenn

Civil Division

Judicial Members: Justice Fox (Chair), Judge Castano, Judge Kricken, Judge Rumpke

Criminal Division

Judicial Members: Justice Kautz

1. Court Records Division - Elisa Butler

A. Committee Work

The purpose of the Court Records Division is to propose rules and statutory changes to clarify the classifications and availability of court records. The Division was created in September of 2019. Committee work will help with eFiling and remote public access. The first working meeting was held at the beginning of December 2020. The Division worked through the first seven (7) titles of the Wyoming Statutes to define levels of access. It is anticipated the next meeting will happen in January 2021 and the Division will work through the next seven (7) titles.

2. Appellate Rules Division – Justice Boomgaarden

A. Chairman Greg Dykeman Working on Reappointments

All Division members with expiring terms were asked to be reappointed and

(Chair), Judge Sharpe, Judge Phillips Evidence Division Judicial Members: Judge Rumpke (Chair), Judge Radda, Judge Phillips Juvenile Division Judicial Members: Judge Wilking (Chair), Justice Kautz, Judge Campbell, Judge Fenn

agreed. There are a few items that have been suggested to the Division to address.

3. Civil Rules Division – Justice Fox

A. New Email Filing Rule and Effective Date

The revision to Wyoming Rule of Civil Procedure 5 for email filing has been approved and will become effective December 5, 2020. As a reminder, this was approved during the last meeting. The email filing allowed during the time of COVID-19 operations has been popular with the attorneys; however unpopular with the clerks of court. The Division is interested in any feedback regarding the revision to Rule 5. During the Summer meeting of the Joint Judiciary Committee, a proposed bill requiring email filing was brought forth.

The next project will include evaluating other relief measure in the Court Rules implemented during COVID-19 operations and if any of those should become permanent.

4. Criminal Rules Division – Justice Kautz

No Update.

5. Rules of Evidence Division – Judge Rumpke

The new member of the Rules of Evidence Division is Judge Paul Phillips. The Division will be completing a comprehensive overview of the rules. This overview will be comparable to what the Civil Rules Division accomplished a few years back.

6. Juvenile Rules Division – Judge Wilking

No Update.

Judicial Ethics Advisory Committee

Judicial Members: Judge Overfield, Judge Bluemel, Judge Greer

1. W.S.C.J.E.A.C Advisory Opinion 2020-01 – Lily Sharpe

The Committee issued the opinion (Appendix 3) in October that found a circuit judges could not take on a paid extra-judicial employment to serve as a liaison for an American Bar Association with respect to DUI laws.

2. Term Expiration and Member Reappointment – Lily Sharpe

Judge Bluemel's first full term on the Judicial Ethics Advisory Committee will expire on December 31, 2020. He served a partial term already when he was appointed to fill Judge Brook's unexpired term. Judge Bluemel has agreed to serve an additional term. Judicial Ethics Advisory Rule 2 provides that the Committee shall be appointed by the Chief Justice and shall consist of three (3) judges or retired justices and two (2) members of the bar.

Chief Justice Davis will appoint Judge Bluemel to a second term by order.

Access to Justice Commission

1. Update – Justice Boomgaarden

A. November 2, 2020 Meeting

Given Angie Dorsch's EJW update, this is a good opportunity to remind BJPA

	members that the Access to Justice Commission has downsized and is focusing on supporting EJW's efforts. Toward that end, Walter Eggers, Angie Dorsch and a few interested Commission members will be meeting with the State's legal service providers to assist in identifying priorities and optimizing resources toward meeting those needs identified in the Statewide Needs Assessment published by DataCorp in August. If anyone needs a link to or copy of the Needs Assessment, please visit the Supreme Court website under Access to Justice Commission or contact Justice Boomgaarden. In addition, the Commission is working on a fee waiver rule (a committee chaired by Stuart Day), a menu of volunteer opportunities for government attorneys who cannot take on a pro bono case (Prof. Lauren McLane Mackenzie Williams), and an updated presentation to provide to community libraries to make available to low income patrons concerning available legal resources (various ATJ Commission members). The Funding Working Group will be exploring alternative funding sources for anticipated long-term revenue declines. Justice Boomgaarden added that she will work with Lisa Finkey to identify means by which courts might provide WiFi hot spots to indigent litigants who need to participate in court proceedings remotely, and asked circuit and district court judges to please contribute any ideas they may have or bring access issues to her attention.
Judicial Education	1. Judicial Orientations – Elisa Butler Judicial Orientations for Judge Allan and Judge Healy are scheduled for January 6, 2020. Thank you to all the judges that have volunteered to assist. The district court schedule is almost complete. We do need a few more circuit court judges and will reach to fill the schedule.
Member Appointment	1. State Council for Interstate Juvenile Supervision – Lily Sharpe
Transcr Tappoment	The Attorney General's Office and DFS has asked for the BJPA to make an appointment to the Council. W.S. § 14-6-102 provides that the Council shall include one (1) member appointed by the BJPA. It appears the last appointment was Judge Waters in 2008.
	Chief Justice Davis asked the conferences to discuss and provide the name of a volunteer to serve on the State Council for Interstate Juvenile Supervision. If no objections are received, an order appointing the volunteer to serve on the State Council for Interstate Juvenile Supervision will be signed. (Appendix 4)
Forms Approval	1. Garnishment Forms – Ronda Munger
	Ronda Munger appeared before the Board to request approval to place newly revised garnishment forms on the Judicial Branch website. In 2019, the Legislature passed House Enrolled Act 31, which provided protections for a defendant's disposable earnings if those earnings were deposited in the defendant's bank account twenty (20) calendar days prior to the service of the writ of garnishment on the banking institution. After passage of the House

Enrolled Act 31, the Circuit Judges Conference assigned Judge Matt Castano and Judge Toni Williams to work with the Administrative Office of the Courts to revise the garnishment forms. The revisions were extensive because the forms had not undergone a complete review since 2004. The forms were then

	approved by the Circuit Judges Conference, with the addition of written instructions. Judge Roberts moved and Judge Haws seconded a motion to place the forms on the website. Motion passed unanimously.		
Audit of Circuit Courts	1. Torrington The audit letter for the Circuit Court located in Torrington was provided to the BJPA.		
New Business	1. Member Input Chief Justice Davis relayed there was a recent update to one of the COVID-19 orders. If there are further changes needed to these orders, please let the Conference Presidents know. Weekly meetings with the Conference Presidents are still happening and have been very productive. Additionally, guidance has been received on contacting the Executive Branch to create priorities for judicial branch personnel to receive the COVID-19 vaccination. Please relay any thoughts you may have to the Conference Presidents. Chief Justice Davis noted the Legislative Session must officially open on January 12, 2021. The swearing in of legislators will be spaced out. There will be a short address by the Governor. It is unclear when the State of the Judiciary will take place.		
Adjournment	The meeting was adjourned at 10:55 p.m.		

Action items:

- 1. Conference presidents will ask for volunteers to serve on the Judiciary Poll Advisory Subcommittee. Chief Justice Davis will sign an order appointing the members.
- **2.** Conference presidents will ask for a volunteer to serve on the State Council for Interstate Juvenile Supervision. Chief Justice Davis will sign an order appointing the member.

Action taken by Board:

- 1. Approved the creation of the Judicial Poll Subcommittee of the BJPA.
- 2. Approved the posting of the updated Garnishment Forms on the Judicial Branch's website.

Appendix 1: Ethics and Disclosure Act Amendments, 21LSO60 v.4

Appendix 2: Order Appointing Members to the Judicial Poll Subcommittee of the Board of Judicial Policy

and Administration

Appendix 3: W.S.C.J.E.A.C Advisory Opinion 2020-01

Appendix 4: Order Appointing Member to the State Council for Interstate Juvenile Supervision

Attachments are highlighted

Approved on February 16, 2021

DRAFT ONLY NOT APPROVED FOR INTRODUCTION

HOUSE BILL NO.

Ethics and Disclosure Act amendments.

Sponsored by: Joint Judiciary Interim Committee

A BILL

for

1 ACT relating to government ethics; amending and establishing definitions and procedures for the Ethics and 2 3 Disclosure Act; expanding the scope of the Act to include 4 governmental entities, the judicial branch additional state employees; amending offenses and penalties 5 of the Ethics and Disclosure Act; amending financial 6 7 disclosure requirements; and providing for an effective date. 8 9 Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Wyoming: 10 11 12 **Section 1**. W.S. 9-13-102(a)(xii)(intro), (xv), 13 creating new paragraphs (xvii) through (xxi)

1

32

```
renumbering (xvii) as (xxii), 9-13-104, 9-13-105(a),
1
2
    (b)(intro) and (ii) and (c), 9-13-106(a)(intro) and (b), 9-
    13-107, 9-13-108(a)(iii) and (b) and 9-13-109(a) and (b)
3
4
   are amended to read:
5
        9-13-102. Definitions.
6
7
8
       (a) As used in this article:
9
10
             (xii) "Public employee" means any of the
   following state employees: employee or at-will contract
11
12
   employee of a state entity or local office;
13
14
    *******************
15
                      ******
16
                         STAFF COMMENT
17
18
    "State entity" and "local office" are terms currently
   defined in the Ethics and Disclosure Act. The definition
19
20
    for "state entity" is amended in this bill draft. The
   definition for "local office" follows:
21
22
23
             (vii) "Local office" means the offices of county
24
    commissioner, county treasurer, county assessor, county
   clerk, county sheriff, county coroner, district attorney,
25
26
    county attorney, clerk of the district court, mayor and
   member of the council of a municipality, member of the
27
28
   board of trustees of a community college district or a
   school district and member of a joint powers board or
29
    special district. As used in this paragraph "special
30
   district means any special district specified under W.S.
31
```

22-29-103(a) and any other corporate district authorized to

be formed as a political subdivision under the laws of this
state;

The Committee may wish to consider whether a definition of "at-will contract employee" is necessary to include in the Ethics and Disclosure Act. For state employees, an at-will contract employee is one whose position is created by the governor exercising his authority under W.S. 9-2-1022(a)(xi)(F)(VI) and for which the position is granted continued authorization through the enactment of the state budget.

Given the changes in this bill draft to include local employees, the Committee may wish to consider whether the definition of "public member" should be amended to include those members appointed to local boards, commissions, and councils.

 Finally, the Committee may wish to consider the breadth of employees, public members, and public officials who should be covered under the Ethics and Disclosure Act. Compare Bretz v. City of Center Line, 276 N.W.2d 617, 618 (Mich. Ct. App. 1979) (holding that a city's anti-nepotism policy was unconstitutionally overbroad because the policy prohibited any hiring that created an immediate family relationship with another employee of any public body), with Sioux City Police Officers Ass'n v. City of Sioux City, 495 N.W.2d 687, 697 (Iowa 1993) (holding that a city's anti-nepotism policy—one that prohibited employees from working in the same department if the employee had a familial or spousal relationship with another employee in that department—was not unconstitutionally overbroad).

37 (xv) "State entity" means a state agency, state
38 office, department, division, bureau, board, commission or
39 council of the state, including the legislature, any court
40 or agency in the judicial branch and the Wyoming community

33

	development authority: and Wyoming science, technology and
2	energy authority. The term does not include a court or an
3	agency in the judicial branch;
4	
5	(xvii) "Judicial branch" means any court or
6	agency in the judicial branch;
7	
8	(xviii) "Judicial officer" means any supreme
9	court justice, district judge, circuit judge, chancery
10	court judge, district court commissioner and magistrate;
11	
12	***************
13 14 15	**************************************

whether to impose discipline on a judicial officer." Neely

4

33

office;

```
v. Wyo. Comm'n on Judicial Conduct & Ethics, 2017 WY 25, ¶
1
    57, 390 P.3d 728, 747 (Wyo. 2017).
2
 3
   Research revealed no case concerning a judicial officer or
 4
5
    employee and the Ethics and Disclosure Act (likely because
    the act expressly does not apply to them). But at least one
6
7
    state has held that the provisions of its governmental-
    ethics act that related to judges were unconstitutional as
    violating the separation of powers. Cusack v. Howlett, 254
   N.E.2d 506, 512 (Ill. 1969). The provisions in Cusack
10
11
    concerned the
                   legislature's authority to establish a
12
    legislative committee
                           to review
                                        potential
                                                   judicial
    impropriety. Another state has noted that the judicial
13
14
   branch (specifically, the state's supreme court) has "an
15
    inherent and implied power" to govern the ethics of all
   members of the judiciary. See In re Kading, 235 N.W.2d 409,
16
17
    412-13 (Wis. 1975).
18
    *******************
19
20
                      ******
21
             (xix) "Personal or private interest" means an
22
23
    interest that is direct and immediate as opposed to
24
    speculative and remote and that provides a greater benefit
25
    or a lesser detriment than it does for a large or
26
    substantial group or class of persons who are similarly
27
   situated;
28
29
             (xx) "Private benefit" means the receipt of a
30
    gift by the public official, judicial officer, public
31
   member or public employee and the receipt of the gift
   resulted from taking action or inaction or his holding that
32
```

1 2 (xxi) "Salaried employment" means an employment 3 relationship under which the employee is compensated, at 4 <u>least</u> in part, by payment of a specified dollar amount for 5 a specified period of service; 6 7 (xvii) (xxii) "This act" means W.S. 9-13-101 8 through 9-13-109. 9 9-13-104. Nepotism. 10 11 (a) No public official, judicial officer, public 12 member or public employee shall advocate or cause the 13 employment, appointment, promotion, transfer or advancement 14 15 of a family member to an office or position of the state, a 16 county, municipality or a school district—a local office, 17 state entity or the judicial branch. A public official, public member or public employee shall not supervise or 18 19 manage a family member who is in an office or position of 20 the state, a county, municipality or school district. 21 (b) A public official, judicial officer, public member 22 or public employee, acting in his official capacity, shall 23

not participate in his official responsibility or capacity 1 regarding a matter relating to the employment or discipline 2 3 of a family member. 4 (c) A public official, judicial officer, public member 5 or public employee shall not supervise or manage a family 6 member who is in an office or position of a local office, 7 8 state entity or the judicial branch, unless the family member began employment in the local office, state entity 9 10 or judicial branch before the public official, judicial officer, public member or public employee began supervising 11 12 or managing the family member. 13 9-13-105. Misuse of office. 14 15 16 (a) A public official, judicial officer, public member 17 or public employee shall not use public funds, time, personnel, facilities or equipment for his private benefit 18 19 or that of another unless the use is authorized by law.

20

21 (b) A public official, <u>judicial officer</u>, public member 22 or public employee shall not use public funds, time,

7

23

1	personnel, facilities or equipment for political or
2	campaign activity unless the use is:
3	
4	(ii) Properly incidental to another activity
5	required or authorized by law and the public official,
6	judicial officer, public employee or public member
7	allocates and reimburses the governmental entity for any
8	additional costs incurred for that portion of the activity
9	not required or authorized by law.
10	
11	(c) A public official, <u>judicial officer,</u> public
12	employee or public member shall not disseminate to another
13	person official information which the public official,
14	judicial officer, public employee or public member obtains
15	through or in connection with his position, unless the
16	information is available to the general public or unless
17	the dissemination is authorized by law.
18	
19	9-13-106. Official decisions and votes.
20	
21	(a) A public official, judicial officer, public member
22	or public employee shall not make an official decision or

vote on an official decision if the public official,

8

1 judicial officer, public member or public employee has a personal or private interest in the matter or obtains or 2 3 stands to obtain a private benefit from the matter. In 4 determining whether he has a personal or private interest in a matter the public official shall recognize 5 importance of his right to represent his constituency and 6 shall abstain from voting only in clear cases of a personal 7 8 or private interest as defined in this subsection or a 9 private benefit. A public official or public member shall 10 not vote to give money or any direct financial benefit to 11 himself except for tax reductions affecting the general 12 public. For the purposes of this section, a personal or private interest: 13 14 (b) A public official, judicial officer, public member 15 or public employee described by subsection (a) of this 16 17 section shall abstain from voting on the decision and from making any official decision in the matter. The public 18 19 official's, judicial officer's, public member's or public

22

21

20

employee's abstention from voting must be recorded in the

governmental entity's official records.

9-13-107. Actions taken while negotiating for employment.

3

4 A public official, judicial officer, public member or

5 public employee may not vote or take an official action in

6 a matter affecting a person with whom the public official,

7 <u>judicial officer</u>, public member or public employee is

8 negotiating for prospective employment.

9

10 9-13-108. Disclosure required.

January 15 of that year:

11

12 (a) Not later than January 31 annually, each of the state's five (5) elected officials and each member of the 13 Wyoming legislature shall file a financial disclosure form 14 with the secretary of state. The form shall be signed by 15 16 the elected official or legislator filing it and under a 17 certification that it is accurate. Except as otherwise provided in this subsection, the financial disclosure form 18 19 shall contain the following information current as of

21

20

22 (iii) A list of all state entities the person, or

23 the person's business enterprise in which the person owns

1 ten percent (10%) or more interest, has a contract with for 2 services and supplies in an amount greater than five 3 thousand dollars (\$5,000.00). The list shall include all 4 contracts subject to this paragraph entered into by the 5 elected official or legislator on and after January 15 of the prior year. For each contract, this list shall include 6 the name and address of the business enterprise, if 7 applicable, and state entity, the type and description of 8 the contract and the effective date and term of the 9 10 contract. For purposes of this paragraph "state entity" as 11 defined in W.S. 9-13-102(a)(xv) shall include a court or an 12 agency in the judicial branch. 13 (b) Forms may be submitted by facsimile transmission 14 15 under the same terms and conditions specified for campaign 16 reports under W.S. 22-25-106. For the purposes of this 17 section, "salaried employment" means an employment relationship under which the employee is compensated, at 18

21

19

20

22 **9-13-109.** Penalties.

23

least in part, by payment of a specified dollar amount for

each month, or longer period, of service.

```
1
        (a) Any person, public official, public member,
   judicial officer or public employee who violates this act
3
   is guilty of a misdemeanor punishable upon conviction by a
4
   fine of not more than one thousand dollars ($1,000.00).
5
    ******************
6
7
                     ******
8
                       STAFF COMMENT
9
   In light of the use of the broad term "person" in W.S. 9-
10
11
   13-109(a) above, the Committee may wish to consider whether
   it is necessary to include a list of specific persons
12
13
   covered under the act (or, alternatively, whether "person"
   should be stricken from the subsection).
14
15
    *******************
16
                     ******
17
18
19
        (b) Violation of any provision of this act constitutes
20
   sufficient cause for termination of a public employee's
   employment or for removal of a public official, judicial
21
22
   officer or public member from his office or position in
   accordance with law.
23
24
        Section 2. W.S. 9-13-102(a)(xii)(A) through (E), 9-13-
25
26
   103(b) and 9-13-106(a)(i) and (ii) are repealed.
27
    *******************
28
                     ******
29
30
                       STAFF COMMENT
```

44

1 2 The bill draft repeals the following provisions: 3 First, W.S. 9-13-102(a)(xii)(A) through (E) list the five 4 5 types of public employees who currently are covered by the Ethics and Disclosure Act: 6 7 9-13-102. Definitions. 8 9 10 (a) As used in this article: 11 12 "Public employee" means the (xii) any of 13 following state employees: 14 15 (A) The attorney general and the director of any department of the executive branch appointed by the 16 governor under W.S. 9-2-1706, or the director of any 17 18 legislative agency; 19 20 (B) The chief executive officer of any separate operating agency under W.S. 9-2-1704(d), except 21 22 those listed in paragraphs (d)(vi) and (x) of that section; 23 24 (C) To the extent the incumbent in the position serves at the pleasure of persons listed in 25 subparagraphs (A) and (B) of this section, administrators 26 of department or agency divisions, and deputy directors of 27 28 departments; 29 30 (D) Commissioners of the public service 31 commission and members of the state board of equalization; 32 33 (E) Deputies and administrators of divisions within the offices of state elected officials under W.S. 9-34 2-1704(a). The positions, in the governor's office, of 35 chief of staff, attorney for intergovernmental affairs and 36 37 chief of policy are included within this subparagraph. 38 39 Next, W.S. 9-13-103(b) defines "private benefit"; this definition is moved to W.S. 9-13-102 (the definitions 40 41 section) in this bill draft: 42 43 9-13-103. Use of title and prestige of public office.

1 (b) As used in this section, "private benefit" means the receipt by the public official, public member or public 2 employee of a gift which resulted from his holding that office. 4 5 Third, W.S. 9-13-106(a)(i) and (ii) define "personal or 6 7 private interest"; this definition has also been moved to W.S. 9-13-102 in this bill draft. 8 9 9-13-106. Official decisions and votes. 10 11 12 A public official, public member or public 13 employee shall not make an official decision or vote on an official decision if the public official, public member or 14 15 public employee has a personal or private interest in the matter. In determining whether he has a personal or private 16 17 interest in a matter the public official shall recognize 18 the importance of his right to represent his constituency and shall abstain from voting only in clear cases of a 19 20 personal or private interest as defined in this subsection. A public official or public member shall not vote to give 21 22 money or any direct financial benefit to himself except for 23 tax reductions affecting the general public. For the 24 purposes of this section, a personal or private interest: 25 26 (i) Is, with respect to the public official, public employee or public member, an interest which is 27 28 direct and immediate as opposed to speculative and remote; 29 and 30 31 (ii) Is an interest that provides the public official, public employee or public member, a greater 32 33 benefit or a lesser detriment than it does for a large or 34 substantial group or class of persons who are similarly 35 situated. 36 ******************* 37 38 ****** 39 40 Section 3. This act is effective July 1, 2021.

42 (END)

41

IN THE SUPREME COURT, STATE OF WYOMING

OCTOBER TERM, A.D. 2020

IN THE MATTER OF THE APPOINTMENT OF MEMBERS TO THE JUDICIAL POLL SUBCOMMITTEE OF THE BOARD OF JUDICIAL POLICY AND ADMINISTRATION		Γ
---	--	-------

ORDER APPOINTING MEMBERS TO THE JUDICIAL POLL SUBCOMMITTEE OF THE BOARD OF JUDICIAL POLICY AND ADMINISTRATION

THIS MATTER came before the Court sua sponte to formally appoint members to the Judicial Poll Subcommittee of the Board of Judicial Policy and Administration, and it is

ORDERED that the following individuals be, and they hereby are, appointed to the Judicial Poll Subcommittee of the Board of Judicial Policy and Administration, and it is

FURTHER ORDERED that the Judicial Poll Subcommittee shall consist of the following members:

Hon. Lynne Boomgaarden
Justice, Wyoming Supreme Court
2301 Capitol Avenue
Cheyenne, WY 82002
Term expires: December 31, 2021

Hon. Timothy C. Day
District Court Judge
P.O. Box 1036
Jackson, WY 83001
Term expires: December 31, 2021

Hon. John G. Fenn
District Court Judge
224 South Main Street, B11J
Sheridan, WY 82801
Term expires: December 31, 2021

Hon. John R. Prokos Circuit Court Judge 50140C US Hwy 191 South, Ste. 200 Rock Springs, WY 82901 Term expires: December 31, 2021

Hon. Susan Stipe
Circuit Court Judge
415 West Pine Street
Rawlins, WY 82301
Term expires: December 31, 2021

DATED this 22nd day of January 2021.

BY THE COURT:

MICHAEL K. DAV

CHIEF JUSTICE

Wyoming Supreme Court Judicial Ethics Advisory Committee W.S.C.J.E.A.C. Advisory Opinion 2020-01

QUESTION PRESENTED

Can a circuit court judge take on extra-judicial employment involving data collection, interpretation and dissemination of information and development of processes related to driving while under the influence laws?

RESPONSE

The Committee answers no to the question presented.

BACKGROUND

The requesting judge is a full-time circuit court judge who receives a salary of \$145,000 per year. In addition to that position, the circuit court judge is seeking a part-time paid position with the American Bar Association Judicial Division to serve as the Region 8 Judicial Outreach Liaison (RJOL). The part-time position requires the applicant to have a law degree and is preferred to be either a sitting or retired judge with experience handling impaired driving cases. The successful applicant for the RJOL position would receive compensation of \$2,000 per month for a total of \$24,000 a year. The position is part of "a cooperative agreement between the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) and the American Bar Association (ABA)." RJOLs function as "educators, writers, consultants, and liaisons, to share the latest research on impaired driving with the judges of their Region. In addition to informing sentencing and interventions in this manner, RJOLs can also provide important insight to policy makers attempting to improve impaired driving traffic safety."

There is an expectation that the successful applicant will devote approximately twenty hours per month to the position. Specific duties of the RJOL position are numerous and extensive as set forth in the provided documentation. Several duties require cooperation, planning and reporting to the ABA, NHTSA and other highway safety officials.

APPLICABLE STATUTES AND RULES OF THE WYOMING CODE OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Canon 1. A Judge Shall Uphold the Integrity and Independence of the Judiciary.

A judge shall uphold and promote the independence, integrity and impartiality of the judiciary and shall avoid impropriety and the appearance of impropriety.

Rule 1.1 Compliance with the Law.

A judge shall comply with the law,* including the Code of Judicial Conduct.

Rule 1.2. Promoting Confidence in the Judiciary.

A judge shall act at all times in a manner that promotes public confidence in the independence,* integrity,* and impartiality* of the judiciary, and shall avoid impropriety* and the appearance of impropriety.*

Rule 1.3 Avoiding Abuse of the Prestige of Judicial Office.

A judge shall not abuse the prestige of judicial office to advance the personal or economic interests* of the judge or others, or knowingly* allow others to do so.

Canon 2. A judge shall perform the duties of judicial office.

A judge shall perform the duties of judicial office impartially, competently, and diligently.

Rule 2.1 Giving Precedence to the Duties of Judicial Office.

The duties of judicial office, as prescribed by law,* shall take precedence over all of a judge's personal and extrajudicial activities.

Rule 2.2. Impartiality and Fairness.

A judge shall uphold and apply the law,* and shall perform all duties of judicial office fairly and impartially.*

Rule 2.4. External Influences on Judicial Conduct.

- (B) A judge shall not permit family, social, political, financial, or other interests or relationships to influence the judge's judicial conduct or judgment.
- (C) A judge shall not convey or permit others to convey the impression that any person or organization is in a position to influence the judge.

Canon 3. A judge shall conduct the judge's personal and extrajudicial activities.

A judge shall conduct the judge's personal and extrajudicial activities to minimize the risk of conflict with the obligations of judicial office.

Rule 3.1. Extrajudicial Activities in General.

A judge may engage in extrajudicial activities, except as prohibited by law* or this Code. However, when engaging in extrajudicial activities, a judge shall not:

(C) participate in activities that would appear to a reasonable person to undermine the judge's independence,* integrity,* or impartiality;*

Rule 3.11. Financial, Business, or Remunerative Activities.

- (B) A judge shall not serve as an officer, director, manager, general partner, advisor, or employee of any business entity except that a judge may manage or participate in:
 - (1) a business closely held by the judge or members of the judge's family;* or
 - (2) a business entity primarily engaged in investment of the financial resources of the judge or members of the judge's family.*

Rule 3.12 Compensation for Extrajudicial Activities.

A judge may accept reasonable compensation for extrajudicial activities permitted by this Code or other law* unless such acceptance would appear to a reasonable person to undermine the judge's independence,* integrity,* or impartiality.*

Comment. — [1] A judge is permitted to accept honoraria, stipends, fees, wages, salaries, royalties, or other compensation for speaking, teaching, writing, and other extrajudicial activities, provided the compensation is reasonable and commensurate with the task performed. The judge should be mindful, however, that judicial duties must take precedence over other activities. See Rule 2.1.

W.S. § 5-9-118. Judge may be district court commissioner; private practice of law prohibited; magistrate of circuit court permitted to practice law.

A judge of a circuit court shall devote full time to the office and may not engage in the private practice of law. . . .

W.S. § 5-9-125. Court continuously in session.

The circuit court shall be continuously in session.

W.S. § 5-9-126. Business hours; judge to be always available for criminal matters.

Circuit courts shall be open for the transaction of business during regular business hours, and in criminal matters a judge, magistrate or district court commissioner shall be available at all times for fixing and accepting bail, issuing warrants including search warrants, and conducting arraignment proceedings.

DISCUSSION

This Committee has been asked to consider whether the requesting judge's employment as an RJOL would violate the Code of Judicial Conduct (hereinafter "Judicial Code"). The entities involved in this position and the specific duties required of the RJOL are the primary factors that guide this opinion.

Judges are required to comply with the law. Full-time employment is not defined for judges. Other definitions of full-time employment include working 8 hours per day and forty hours per week. Greub v. Frith, 717 P.2d 323, 325 (Wyo. 1986). Judges must act "in a manner that promotes public confidence in the independence, integrity, and impartiality of the judiciary, and shall avoid impropriety and the appearance of impropriety." (Rule 1.2)(asterisks omitted). Consequently, judges are required to avoid extrajudicial "activities that would appear to a reasonable person to undermine the judge's independence, integrity, or impartiality." (Rule 3.1 (C)(asterisks omitted). In this matter, the requesting judge presides in a circuit court. Circuit courts have jurisdiction over some civil and criminal driving while under the influence and other driving and alcohol related offenses. Thus, circuit court judges should anticipate heightened scrutiny for their involvement in any extrajudicial activities that relate to those areas of the law and as would relate to their availability and compensation. In the request for this opinion, the judge did not express concern that this position would create an appearance of impropriety. However, this Committee has concerns about the involvement of a well-known opponent of driving and alcohol violations in funding and oversight of the position. This significant involvement could create an appearance of impropriety in violation of Rule 1.2 and 3.1(C). Moreover, this Committee has serious concerns that receiving compensation of \$24,000 a year in addition to the judge's full-time salary would be improper and if not improper, would create an appearance of impropriety, especially when considering the RJOL position would require approximately 20 hours of part-time work while performing the judge's full-time duties that include being available at all times for fixing and accepting bail, issuing warrants including search warrants, and conducting arraignment proceedings.

This Committee has additional concerns as relating to the duties of the RJOL that may involve active lobbying for legislative change of state statutes that the judiciary must interpret and enforce. These duties may have the propensity to implicate a violation of other rules of the Judicial Code. For instance, judges must avoid "abuse [of] the prestige of judicial office to advance the personal or economic interests of the judge or others, or knowingly allow

others to do so." (Rule 1.3)(asterisks omitted). Because of the prestige of the judicial office, the mere fact of the judge's involvement may be used by an organization as a tool of credibility to advance the legislative interests of a certain organization or its other members. In addition, judges "shall not permit family, social, political, financial, or other interests or relationships to influence the judge's judicial conduct or judgment[,]" or "convey or permit others to convey the impression that any person or organization is in a position to influence the judge." (Rule 2.4 (B) and (C)). When an organization publicly lobbies for certain legislative changes, such as increasing criminal punishment for driving or alcohol related offenses, it may convey the perception that the organization or its members exert improper influence on the judge through his or her extrajudicial employment. This concern is primarily directed to the involvement of NHTSA in the role served by the RJOL.

This Committee recognizes it has always been the case that members of the judiciary have been included in commissions or groups dedicated to improvements in the law in specific areas, for instance the Governor's Council on Impaired Driving and the Domestic Violence Elimination Council. These are somewhat similar to the role being sought in this matter, however, they are distinguishable in that they are not paid positions, there are not specific duties or requirements to fulfill in order to receive a paycheck, and they are supported by a State specific government entity for which a circuit court judge is already employed.

CONCLUSION

The part-time paid employment being considered, even if not specifically precluded by law or rule, would be contrary to being wholly devoted to the full-time service statutorily required by a circuit court judge. The Committee also finds that the RJOL position has the significant involvement of a well-known national organization that lobbies for laws related to those primarily adjudicated by circuit courts in Wyoming. This involvement could further undermine the judiciary's impartiality, integrity, independence, and public confidence. Therefore, this extrajudicial employment is not endorsed by this Committee.

FINALIZED AND EFFECTIVE this 1st day of October, 2020 by the Wyoming Supreme Court Judicial Ethics Advisory Committee.

An independent judiciary requires that judges decide cases according to the laws and facts, without regard to whether particular laws or litigants are popular or unpopular with the public, the media, government officials, or the judge's friends or family. Confidence in the judiciary is eroded if judicial decision making is *perceived* to be subject to inappropriate outside influences." (Emphasis added.)

¹ The Comment for Rule 2.4 states:

IN THE SUPREME COURT, STATE OF WYOMING

OCTOBER TERM, A.D. 2020

IN THE MATTER OF THE APPOINTMENT TO THE STATE COUNCIL FOR INTERSTATE JUVENILE SUPERVISION

IN THE SUPREME COURT STATE OF WYOMING FILED

1

HAWNA GOETZ, CLEAK

ORDER APPOINTING MEMBER TO THE STATE COUNCIL FOR INTERSTATE JUVENILE SUPERVISION

THIS MATTER having come before the Court upon the request of the Board of Judicial Policy and Administration that the Honorable Dawnessa Snyder be appointed to the State Council for Interstate Juvenile Supervision; and the Court being fully advised, it is

ORDERED that the Honorable Dawnessa Snyder be, and hereby is, appointed to serve as a member of the State Council for Interstate Juvenile Supervision.

DATED this 12th day of January, 2021.

FOR THE COURT:

MICHAEL K. DAVIS CHIEF JUSTICE